Audit of

School Impact Fee Collections

August 20, 2021

Report #2021-06



MISSION STATEMENT

The mission of the School District of Palm Beach County is to educate, affirm, and inspire each student in an equity-embedded school system.

Michael J. Burke Superintendent of Schools

School Board Members

Frank A. Barbieri, Jr., Esq., Chair Karen M. Brill, Vice Chair Marcia Andrews Alexandra Ayala Barbara McQuinn Debra L. Robinson, M.D. Erica Whitfield

Audit Committee Members

David H. Talley, Chair Tammy McDonald, Vice Chair Mark Bymaster, CPA, CFE Leondrae D. Camel Michael Dixon, CPA/PFS Kathleen Weigel, Ed.D. (Vacant)

Audit Committee Representatives

Frank A. Barbieri, Jr., Esq., School Board Chair Michael J. Burke, Superintendent of Schools Heather Frederick, CPA, Chief Financial Officer Shawntoyia Bernard, Esq., General Counsel Maria Lloyd, Principal Representative Justin Katz, CTA President

Audit of

School Impact Fee Collections

Table of Contents

	Page
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	i
PURPOSE AND AUTHORITY	1
SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY	1
BACKGROUND	2
CONCLUSIONS	
 School Impact Fees Were Accurately Assessed and Collected by County's Planning, Zoning and Building Department 	4
2. Administrative Fee Rate Needs to be Reviewed	5
 District Procedures for Monitoring and Requesting Remittances from the County Need to be Codified 	6
APPENDIX	

Management's Response

8

This page intentionally left blank.

Audit of School Impact Fee Collections

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Pursuant to the *Office of Inspector General's (OIG) 2019-20 Work Plan*, we have audited the School Impact Fee Collections for the period of July 2018 through February 2020. The primary objectives of this audit were to (1) determine whether school impact fees were accurately assessed and collected by Palm Beach County (County), and (2) assess the adequacy of the School District's process in monitoring and requesting remittance of School Impact Fee revenues from the County. The audit produced the following major conclusions.

1. School Impact Fees Were Accurately Assessed and Collected by County's Planning, Zoning and Building Department

The OIG obtained, from the County, the information for 2,582 sample new residential building permits issued by the County and 18 municipalities¹ during July 2018 through February 2020. These 2,582 permits collected a total of \$6.9 million in School Impact Fees (Fees). Our review concluded that the Fees assessed and collected from these 2,582 permits were accurate.

Management's Response: Management concurs. (See page 8.)

2. Administrative Fee Rate Needs to be Reviewed

Palm Beach County's Unified Land Development Code, Article 13, states, "The local government collecting the impact fee shall be entitled to retain 3.4 percent of the funds collected as an administrative fee not to exceed the costs associated with the collection of the impact fees."

Administrative Fees Accurately Assessed at the Current Rate. The ePZB System is programmed to automatically calculate and deduct 3.4% from each Impact Fee collected to ensure accuracy and consistency in assessing the administrative fees. Our review of 18 sample School Impact Fee collections concluded that the administrative fees were accurately assessed.

Administrative Fee Rate May Need to be Adjusted. On April 16, 2019, the Palm Beach County Board of County Commissioners (BCC) approved the increase of School Impact Fee rates, depending on building size, by 172% to 266%, at an average of 230%, effective August 1, 2020.

¹ During the Audit Period, 18 of the 39 municipalities in Palm Beach County had Interlocal Agreements with the County authorizing the County's Planning, Zoning and Building Department to calculate and collect Impact Fees on their behalf.

The increase in School Impact Fee Rates by an average of 230% would result in a corresponding increase in administrative fees charged to the District. As indicated by the County's Impact Fee Manager, a total of \$26 million (net of administrative fee) in School Impact Fees was collected during March 2020 through March 2021. Based on the current rate of 3.4%, the District would be assessed an estimated \$0.9 million in administrative fees for the \$26 million in School Impact Fees collected during this 12-month period.

The updated Impact Fee Rates Schedule should have no or minimal impact on the processes and costs to the County and municipalities in collecting the Impact Fees. To ensure the current 3.4% administrative fee assessed by the County and municipalities does not exceed their costs for collecting School Impact Fee, the District should collaborate with the County and municipalities to review and adjust the administrative fee if needed.

Management's Response: Management concurs. Recently approved legislation limits the administrative charges to actual costs. (See page 8.)

3. District Procedures for Monitoring and Requesting Remittances from the County Need To Be Codified

Annually, the District's Treasury Department submits to the County a request for remittance of the available School Impact Fee fund balance maintained at the County and a list of completed capital projects to which the requested funds will be applied.

During Fiscal Years 2017 through 2019, the District submitted School Impact Fee remittance requests to the County during June of each year. In March 2020, the District inquired of the County and was informed that the available fund balance was \$10.2 million as of March 2, 2020. However, no new remittance requests were submitted to the County after June 2019; the County's Impact Fee Manager indicated that the available fund balance as of March 22, 2021, was \$36.2 million.

We noted that the District's Treasurer is the only employee responsible for (1) maintaining the inventory of new school construction eligible for funding by Impact Fees, (2) requesting remittance of Impact Fee revenues from the County, and (3) deciding to which construction projects funds will be allocated. There was no support staff to assist the Treasurer in monitoring and requesting remittance of School Impact Fee revenues from the County.

To assist the District's in ensuring consistency, accuracy, and continuity for monitoring and submitting School Impact Fee Remittance Requests, the District should (a) codify the procedures for monitoring and requesting remittance of School Impact Fee from the County, (b) assign and train additional staff members to assist the Treasurer in monitoring and submitting School Impact Fee Remittance Requests to the County, and (c) submit School Impact Fee Remittance Requests to the County, at least once a year.

Management's Response: Management concurs. The District is working with County Staff to modify the procedures that were imposed by the County Clerk many years ago. The goal is to automate the transfer of funds to the School District as currently required by the County ordinance. Additional staff within the Treasury Department will receive training to monitor the process and ensure funds are transmitted to the School District at least once each year. (See page 8.)



THE SCHOOL DISTRICT OF PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA

OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL 3318 FOREST HILL BLVD., C-306 WEST PALM BEACH, FL 33406

(561) 434-7335 FAX: (561) 434-8652 www.palmbeachschools.org Hotline: (855) 561-1010

MEMORANDUM

TERESA MICHAEL, CIG, CIGI, CFE INSPECTOR GENERAL

SCHOOL BOARD FRANK A. BARBIERI, JR., ESQ., CHAIRMAN KAREN M. BRILL, VICE CHAIRMAN MARCIA ANDREWS ALEXANDRA AYALA BARBARA MCQUINN DEBRA L. ROBINSON, M.D. ERICA WHITFIELD

MICHAEK J. BURKE, SUPERINTENDENT

TO: Honorable Chair and Members of the School Board Michael J. Burke, Superintendent of Schools Chair and Members of the Audit Committee

FROM: Teresa Michael, Inspector General

DATE: August 20, 2021

SUBJECT: Audit of School Impact Fee Collections

PURPOSE AND AUTHORITY

Pursuant to the *Office of Inspector General's (OIG) 2019-20 Work Plan*, we have audited the School Impact Fee Collections for the period of July 2018 through February 2020. The primary objectives of this audit were to (1) determine whether school impact fees were accurately assessed and collected by Palm Beach County Government, and (2) assess the adequacy of the School District's process in monitoring and requesting remittance of School Impact Fee revenues from the County.

SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY

This audit was performed in accordance with *Government Auditing Standards*. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions.

The audit covered the School Impact Fees collected by the County Government² during July 1, 2018, through February 29, 2020. The audit included interviewing District Staff and the County's Impact Fee Manager, and reviewing:

- Section 163.31801, Florida Statutes Florida Impact Fee Act
- Palm Beach County's Unified Land Development Code, Article 13

² During Fiscal Years 2016 through 2019, Palm Beach County collected a total of \$28 million in School Impact Fees comprised of \$16 million (57%) collected by the County Government and \$12 million (43%) by 21 other municipalities. Fees collected by the County Government included permits issued by the County for unincorporated areas and 18 municipalities that have Interlocal Agreements authorizing the County to calculate and collect the fees on their behalf. The Palm Beach County's Internal Audit Department completed three audits of Impact Fee collections at selected municipalities between Fiscal Years 2011 and 2016; no significant control deficiencies were noted by the audits.

- District financial records:
 - Listing of Capital Projects funded by School Impact Fees
 - Requests for funds submitted to the County government
 - Receipts of funds and accounting records
- Building permit records maintained by the County's Planning, Zoning and Building Department:
 - Permit applications submitted during the testing period
 - Building drawings submitted as part of the permit application packet
 - Collection of fees
 - Permits issued during the audit period

Draft audit findings were sent to the Chief Financial Office and Chief Operating Office for review and comments. Management responses are included in the Appendix. We appreciate the courtesy and cooperation extended to us by District and County staff during the audit. The final draft report was presented to the Audit Committee at its August 20, 2021, Meeting.

BACKGROUND

<u>School Impact Fees</u>. All Florida Counties' Boards of County Commissioners assess Impact Fees to help pay for roads, parks, schools, and other infrastructure needs each time a building permit is issued³. School Impact Fees have been assessed in Palm Beach County (County) since 1988 and are based on the square footage of the proposed residential unit⁴. School Impact Fees collected by Palm Beach County are periodically remitted to the School District (District) upon the District's request. School Impact Fee Revenue may only be used for new school construction or addition of student stations to existing facilities.

<u>Collection of Impact Fees</u>. Building permits are issued by the County and municipalities for building projects within their jurisdictions. Impact Fees are collected by each permitting authority, unless an Interlocal Agreement (ILA) exists authorizing the County to calculate and collect the Impact Fees on behalf of the participating municipality⁵. For those municipalities that have an ILA with the County, the County's Planning, Zoning and Building Department (PZB) reviews the plans and specifications of the permit application for calculating and collecting the Impact Fees.

<u>Accounting and Custody of Impact Fees</u>. The Finance Department of the Palm Beach County Clerk of the Circuit Court & Comptroller's Office⁶ (Clerk) is responsible for the proper accounting and custody of impact fee collections. Each permitting authority is responsible for remitting collections and transmitting all required financial information and records to the Clerk in a timely manner.

³ Section 163.31801, Florida Statutes – Florida Impact Fee Act

⁴ Palm Beach County's Unified Land Development Code, Article 13 states, "School Impact Fees are imposed upon all development creating an impact on schools".

⁵ During the Audit Period, 18 of the 39 municipalities in Palm Beach County had Interlocal Agreements with the County authorizing the County's PZB to calculate and collect Impact Fees on their behalf.

⁶ The Palm Beach County Clerk of the Circuit Court & Comptroller's Office is a Constitutional Office independent from the County's Board of County Commissioners and the County Government.

<u>Updated School Impact Fee Schedule</u>. On April 16, 2019, the Palm Beach County Board of County Commissioners (BCC) approved the increase of School Impact Fee rates based on the 2018 independent study performed by Tindale Oliver & Associates. The new School Impact Fee Schedule increased the fees from a range of \$793 - \$1,866 to a range of \$2,362 - \$6,608 per residential unit, to be phased in over a two-year period. The first increase was effective for all permits filed between August 1, 2019, and July 31, 2020. The second and final increment took effect for permits filed on or after August 1, 2020.

Table 1
School Impact Fee Schedules

		School Impact Fees	
Building Size	Prior to 8/1/2019	8/1/2019 - 7/31/2020	On/After 8/1/2020
800 sq. ft. and under	\$793	\$1,578	\$2,362
801 to 1,399 sq. ft.	\$1,593	\$2,962	\$4,330
1,400 to 1,999 sq. ft.	\$1,710	\$3,931	\$6,153
2,000 to 3,599 sq. ft.	\$1,866	\$4,237	\$6,608
3,600 sq. ft. and over	\$1,776	\$4,141	\$6,506

Source: Palm Beach County Planning, Zoning and Building Department website (accessed on October 7, 2020) https://discover.pbcgov.org/pzb/administration/Pages/Impact-Fees.aspx

The revised fee schedule was expected to increase the School Impact Fee Revenue from an average of \$6.8 million per year during 2016 through 2019, to an estimated \$17 million for 2020, or an increase of \$10.2 million (150%).

Table 2
School Impact Fee Receipts
During Fiscal Years 2016 Through 2019

Fiscal	Sch	nool Impact Fees ^(a)		Remittance	es Received B	y The District ^(b)
Year ⁽¹⁾	Collected by the County's PZB ⁽²⁾	Collected by 21 Municipalities	Total	Date Requested	Date Received	Amount Received ⁽³⁾
2016	\$3,368,095	\$4,409,729	\$7,777,824	04/07/16	07/27/16	\$7,725,360
2017	4,043,392	2,593,947	6,637,339	06/04/17	07/03/17	6,947,747
2018	3,707,122	2,414,132	6,121,254	06/06/18	08/13/18	6,030,958
2019	4,670,941	2,903,948	7,574,889	06/25/19	09/23/19	6,447,347
Total	\$15,789,550	\$12,321,756	\$28,111,306			\$27,151,412

Sources: (a) PBC Board of County Commissioners Impact Fee Reports website (accessed on October 7, 2020) <u>https://discover.pbcgov.org/pzb/administration/ImpactFees/Financial%20Reports.aspx</u>

(b) School District's PeopleSoft System

Notes: (1) The County's Fiscal Year runs from October 1 through September 30. The School District's Fiscal Year runs from July 1 through June 30.

(2) Included permits issued by the County Government and the 18 municipalities that have ILAs with the County authorizing the County's PBZ to calculate and collect the fees on their behalf.

(3) As of March 10, 2021, no remittance requests were submitted to the County since last submission in June 2019.

CONCLUSIONS

This audit produced the following major conclusions:

1. School Impact Fees Were Accurately Assessed and Collected by County's Planning, Zoning and Building Department

The County's Planning, Zoning and Building Department (PZB) calculates and collects impact fees for residential building projects located in unincorporated areas and for those within the 18 municipalities that have agreements with the County authorizing the County's PZB to calculate and collect Impact Fees on their behalf. The County maintains the information of building permits issued by the County and the 18 municipalities in their ePZB Database. Pertinent information includes the property/owner information, scope of work, final project valuation, fee calculations, and supporting documents for building permit applications within its jurisdiction.

The OIG obtained, from the County's PZB, the information for 2,582 sample new residential building permits issued by the County and 18 municipalities during July 2018 through February 2020. These 2,582 permits collected a total of \$6.9 million in School Impact Fees (Fees). See Table 3 below for a summary.

Table 3School Impact Fees Collected by County's PZBDuring July 2018 Through February 2020

	# of Permits	Total Fees Collected
July 1, 2018 – June 30, 2019	1,535	\$3,373,274
July 1, 2019 – February 29, 2020	1,047	3,506,622
Totals	2,582	\$6,879,896

Source: County's ePZB Database.

<u>Analytical Review</u>. Based on the square footage and applicable fee schedules, we calculated the estimated School Impact Fees for each of the 2,582 permits issued by the County and the 18 municipalities during July 2018 through February 2020. Table 4 summarizes the results of the analysis and comparing the estimated fees with the actual collections by the County.

Table 4Results of Analytical Review

	Per	mits	School In	npact Fees	Net Difference
Discrepancy Per Permit (Estimated vs. Actual)	#	%	Total Estimated Fees (A)	Total Collected by the County (B)	Between Estimated and Actual (A) - (B)
Less than \$5 each	2,318	90%	\$4,850,623	\$4,850,077	\$546
Greater than \$5 each or					
with other exceptions	264	10%	2,258,840	2,029,819	\$229,021
Total	2,582	100%	\$7,109,463	\$6,879,896	(\$229,567)

<u>Fees Collected for 90% of the Permits Appeared Accurate</u>. The preliminary analysis revealed that the School Impact Fees collected by the County appeared accurate for 2,318 of the 2,582 permits issued during July 2018 through February 2020. The difference between the estimated fees and the fees collected by the County for these 2,318 permits was less than \$5 each, with a total discrepancy of \$546 or 0.01% of the \$4.9 million collected from these permits.

<u>No Exceptions Noted for the Other 10% Permits</u>. The remaining 264 (10%) permits had differences between the estimated fees and the County's collections greater than \$5 each or other exceptions⁷, with a total discrepancy of \$229,021 or 11% of the 2 million collected from these permits. We judgmentally selected 60 samples, based on the significance of the discrepancies and the nature of the permits, for detailed examination. Based on the supporting documentation for the permits maintained by the County, we concluded that the Impact Fees for the 60 samples were properly assessed, collected, and recorded into the County's ePZB System.

Management's Response: Management concurs. (See page 8.)

2. Administrative Fee Rate Needs to be Reviewed

Administrative Fees Accurately Assessed at the Current Rate. Pursuant to Palm Beach County's Unified Land Development Code, Article 13:

"The local government collecting the impact fee shall be entitled to retain 3.4 percent of the funds collected as an administrative fee not to exceed the costs associated with the collection of the impact fees."

According to the County's Impact Fee Manager, the ePZB System is programmed to automatically calculate and deduct 3.4% from each Impact Fee collected to ensure accuracy and consistency in assessing the administrative fees.

Our review of 18 sample School Impact Fee collections concluded that the administrative fees were accurately assessed at 3.4% allowed by the *Palm Beach County's Unified Land Development Code*.

Administrative Fee Rate May Need to be Adjusted. On April 16, 2019, the County's BCC approved the increase of School Impact Fee rates, depending on building size, by 172% to 266%, at an average of 230%, effective August 1, 2020. (See Table 5.)

⁷ Some of the records we initially received from the County's PZB did not contain certain required information for calculating the School Impact Fees. Missing information included credits due to the applicants and the dates of the permit applications, etc.

	Increase in Schoo	l Impact Fees	
		School Impact Fees	
Building Size	Prior to 8/1/2019	On/After 8/1/2020	% Increase
	(A)	(B)	From (A) to (B)
800 sq. ft. and under	\$793	\$2,362	198%
801 to 1,399 sq. ft.	\$1,593	\$4,330	172%
1,400 to 1,999 sq. ft.	\$1,710	\$6,153	260%
2,000 to 3,599 sq. ft.	\$1,866	\$6,608	254%
3,600 sq. ft. and over	\$1,776	\$6,506	266%

Table 5Increase in School Impact Fees

Source: Palm Beach County Planning, Zoning and Building Department website (accessed on October 7, 2020) https://discover.pbcgov.org/pzb/administration/Pages/Impact-Fees.aspx

The increase in School Impact Fee Rates by an average of 230% would result in a corresponding increase in administrative fees charged to the District. As indicated by the County's Impact Fee Manager, a total of \$26 million (net of administrative fee) in School Impact Fees was collected during March 2020 through March 2021. Based on the current rate of 3.4%, the District would be assessed an estimated \$0.9 million in administrative fees for the \$26 million in School Impact Fees collected during this 12-month period.

Recommendation

The updated Impact Fee Rates Schedule should have no or minimal impact on the processes and costs to the County and municipalities in collecting the Impact Fees. To ensure the current 3.4% administrative fee assessed by the County and municipalities does not exceed their costs for collecting School Impact Fee, the District should work with the County and municipalities to review and adjust the administrative fee rate as needed.

Management's Response: Management concurs. Recently approved legislation limits the administrative charges to actual costs. (See page 8.)

3. District Procedures for Monitoring and Requesting Remittances from the County Need to be Codified

Impact Fee Revenues for New School Construction. School Impact Fees provide part of the funding for new school construction. The District's Treasury Department (Treasury) maintains a list of construction projects eligible for School Impact Fees. Upon completion of a growth-based capital project, the District forwards the final construction contract to the County's Legal Department and adds the new school to the list of schools eligible for funding by School Impact Fees. During 2015 through 2019, the Impact Fee revenues were allocated to four schools completed during 2001 through 2008.

<u>Request of Remittance for School Impact Fees</u>. Annually, Treasury submits to the County a request for remittance of available School Impact Fee fund balance maintained at the County. The request includes a list of completed capital projects to which requested funds will be applied.

<u>No Remittance Requests Made Since June 2019</u>. During Fiscal Years 2017 through 2019, the District submitted School Impact Fee remittance requests to the County during June of each year. In March 2020, the District inquired of the County and was informed that the available fund balance was \$10.2 million as of March 2, 2020. However, no new remittance requests were submitted to the County since the last request of June 2019. The County's Impact Fee Manager indicated that the available fund balance was \$36.2 million as of March 22, 2021.

<u>Training of Staff For Maintaining School Impact Fees Needed</u>. We noted that the District's Treasurer is the only employee responsible for (1) maintaining the inventory of new school construction eligible for funding by Impact Fees, (2) requesting remittance of Impact Fee revenues from the County, and (3) deciding which construction projects to which funds will be allocated. There was no support staff to assist the Treasurer in monitoring and requesting remittance of School Impact Fee revenues from the County.

Recommendation

To assist the District's in ensuring consistency, accuracy, and continuity for monitoring and submitting School Impact Fee Remittance Requests, the District should:

- a. Codify the procedures for monitoring and requesting remittance of School Impact Fee from the County.
- b. Assign and train additional staff members to assist the Treasurer in monitoring and submitting School Impact Fee Remittance Requests to the County.
- c. Submit School Impact Fee Remittance Request to the County regularly, at least once a year.

Management's Response: Management concurs. The District is working with County Staff to modify the procedures that were imposed by the County Clerk many years ago. The goal is to automate the transfer of funds to the School District as currently required by the County ordinance. Additional staff within the Treasury Department will receive training to monitor the process and ensure funds are transmitted to the School District at least once each year. (See page 8.)

– End of Report –

Management's Response

SCHOOL DIST	THE SCHOOL DISTRICT OF PALM BEACH COUNTY, FL	MICHAEL J. BURKE CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER	DONALD E. FENNOY II, ED. D. Superintendent
H BEACH COUNT	Chief Financial Office 3300 Forest Hill Boulevard, Suite C-316 West Palm Beach, FL 33406		
	PHONE: 561-434-8584 / FAX: 561-357-7585 WWW.PALMBEACHSCHOOLS.ORG/CFO		
Memoran	DUM	R	ECEIVEN
TO:	Teresa Michael, Inspector General	185	JUN - 8 2021
FROM:	Michael J. Burke, Chief Financial Officer	Mgs INSI	PECTOR GENERAL
DATE:	June 8, 2021		
SUBJECT:	Response to Audit of School Impact Fee	Collections	
	has reviewed the Audit Report related to onses to recommendations.	o School Impact Fee Col	lections and has provided the
Depar		and Collected by County's	Planning, Zoning and Building
Manag	gement Concurs		
	istrative Fee Rate Needs to be Reviewed gement Concurs – Recently approved legis	lation limits the administ	rative charges to actual costs
<u>Manas</u> impose Districi	t Procedures for Monitoring and Requesting gement Concurs – The District is working ed by the County Clerk many years ago. The t as currently required by the County ording the county ording to monitor the process and e	with County Staff to mo ne goal is to automate the nance. Additional staff w	dify the procedures that were transfer of funds to the School ithin the Treasury Department
once e	ach year		
MJB/LE:mw			
	e Evans, Treasurer Law, Director of Audit		
	The School District of Pal A Top High-Performing An Equal Opportunity Educa	A-Rated School District	